1	Is an Epic Pluvial Masking the Water Insecurity of the Greater New York City Region?
2	
3	Neil Pederson <sup>1*</sup> , Andrew R. Bell <sup>1</sup> Edward R. Cook <sup>1</sup> , Upmanu Lall <sup>2</sup> , Naresh Devineni <sup>3</sup> , Richard
4	Seager <sup>4</sup> , Keith Eggleston <sup>5</sup> and Kevin J. Vranes <sup>6</sup>
5	
6	<sup>1</sup> Tree Ring Laboratory of Lamont-Doherty Earth Observatory of Columbia University,
7	Palisades, NY 10964; <sup>2</sup> Department of Earth and Environmental Engineering, Columbia Water
8	Center, Columbia University, New York, NY 10027; <sup>3</sup> Columbia Water Center
9	The Earth Institute, Columbia University, New York, NY 10027; <sup>4</sup> Lamont-Doherty Earth
10	Observatory of Columbia University, Palisades, NY 10964; <sup>5</sup> Northeast Regional Climate Center
11	Ithaca, NY 14853; <sup>6</sup> Boulder, CO 80309.
12	
13	
14	
15	*Corresponding author: Neil Pederson, Tree Ring Laboratory of Lamont-Doherty Earth
16	Observatory and Columbia University, P.O. Box 1000, 61 Rt 9W, Palisades, NY 10964,
17	adk@ldeo.columbia.edu, Phone: 845-365-8392.
18	

18 ABSTRACT:

Six water emergencies have occurred since 1981 for the New York City region (NYC) despite: 19 1) its perhumid climate, 2) substantial conservation of water since 1979 and 3) meteorological 20 data showing little severe or extreme drought since 1970. We reconstruct 472 years of moisture 21 availability for the NYC watershed to place these emergencies in long-term hydroclimatic 22 context. Using nested reconstruction techniques, 32 tree-ring chronologies comprised of 12 23 species account for up to 66.2% of the average May-August Palmer Drought Severity Index. 24 Verification statistics indicate good statistical skill from 1531-2003. The use of multiple tree 25 26 species, including rarely-used species that can sometimes occur on mesic sites like *Liriodendron* tulipifera, Betula lenta and Carva spp., seems to aid reconstruction skill. Importantly, the 27 reconstruction captures pluvial events in the instrumental record nearly as well as drought events 28 29 and is significantly correlated to precipitation over much of the northeastern US. While the mid-1960s drought is a severe drought in the context of the new reconstruction, the region 30 experienced repeated droughts of similar intensity, but greater duration during the 16<sup>th</sup> and 17<sup>th</sup> 31 centuries. The full record reveals a trend towards more pluvial conditions since ca 1800 that is 32 accentuated by an unprecedented, 43-year pluvial event that continues through 2011. In the 33 context of the current pluvial, decreasing water usage, but increasing extra-urban pressures, it 34 appears that the water supply system for the greater NYC region could be severely stressed if the 35 current water boom shifts towards hydroclimatic regimes like the 16<sup>th</sup> and 17<sup>th</sup> centuries. 36

37

### 38 1. Introduction

Despite a perhumid climate, a lack of extreme drought (Figure 1; Supplemental Figure 39 S1), increased precipitation since the 1960s (Horton et al., 2011; Seager et al. 2012) and 40 significant reduction in water consumption (from a peak of 787 liters per person per day in 1988) 41 to 477 in 2009), the New York City (NYC) metropolitan region has suffered a series of water 42 warnings and emergencies (1980-82, 1985, 1989, 1991, 1995, and 2002) in the last three decades 43 (NYC Dept. of Env. Protection 2011). This resource stress under favorable conditions highlights 44 the challenge of maintaining reliable water supply to an urban metropolis of more than 8 million 45 people. The population of the five boroughs of NYC is expected to swell to more than 9 million 46 by 2030 (NYC Dept. of City Planning 2006), suggesting that without concomitant increases in 47 water supply, such emergency states may become a more frequent occurrence. Recent 48 49 scholarship has pointed to an upward trend in precipitation and a downward trend in consecutive dry days in meteorological records of the Northeast US since the region's last extreme drought in 50 1962-1966 (e.g., Burns et al. 2007; Spierre and Wake 2010). However, it would be risky to infer 51 that NYC's future water supply is secure on the basis of this poorly understood trend. A longer, 52 regional context, and understanding of the potential forcing factors driving this trend, is 53 54 necessary to fully consider the water security of NYC and its surrounding region.

A recent analysis of precipitation variability across NYC's Catskill Mountains water supply region was performed by Seager et al. (2012). A survey of 23 meteorological stations covering the Catskill Mountains and the lower Hudson Valley, immediately north of NYC, indicates 1) that the 1960s drought is the most significant in the century long instrumental record, and 2) that there has been a detectable increase in precipitation throughout the region since the early 1970s. This increase, when averaged across the region, resembles a step-change increase in

precipitation, a shift also seen in an analysis focused solely on NYC (Horton et al., 2011). 61 Neither the 1960s drought nor the recent pluvial seem forced by sea surface temperatures 62 variations or related to radiatively-driven climate change (Seager et al. 2012). Instead the 1960s 63 drought coincided with an extreme negative phase of the North Atlantic Oscillation (NAO) 64 (Namias 1966; Horton et al. 2009; Seager et al. 2012) while the shift to wetter conditions in the 65 1970s was also associated with a shift to a more positive phase of the NAO (Seager et al. 2012). 66 However, no apparent links between Catskills precipitation and the NAO were found at shorter 67 timescales. Seager et al. (2012) concluded that the main driver of precipitation variability in the 68 69 region over the last 110 years was therefore probably internal atmospheric variability. This conclusion needs to be evaluated in the context of much longer records to aid in identifying the 70 frequency and severity of droughts and pluvial events as well as trends of regional hydroclimate 71 and to better understand the mechanisms of climate variability in the region. 72

Tree-ring analysis is used here to expand our long-term knowledge of drought variation 73 in the NYC watershed and surrounding region. Beginning with the classic demonstration by 74 Stockton and Jacoby (1976) that water resource management plans were based on insufficient 75 records of climate variability, tree-ring based reconstructions of hydroclimate have recently 76 assisted in understanding long-term climate patterns and trends for water resource management 77 and their influence on society (e.g., Cook and Jacoby 1977; 1983; Stahle et al. 1988; Woodhouse 78 and Lukas 2006; Buckley et al. 2010; Gou et al. 2010; Woodhouse et al. 2010; Büntgen et al. 79 80 2011; Maxwell et al. 2011; Meko and Woodhouse 2011; Pederson et al., 2012). A study of water shortages and drought from 1900-2002 in Rockland County, NY, just north of NYC, found a 81 significant disagreement between water supply and usage in recent decades (Lyon et al. 2005). 82 83 When Lyon et al. (2005) explored longer, regional drought history using the North American

84	Drought Atlas (NADA) (Cook and Krusic 2004; Cook et al. 1999; 2008), they concluded that the
85	recent drought was within the range of natural variability and there were eight others comparable
86	to the 1960's drought. A new reconstruction in the Delaware River basin indicates the 1960's
87	drought to be the most severe over the last ca 260 years (Devineni et al. accepted with revision,
88	Journal of Climate). However, the most recent reconstruction of drought variability specifically
89	for the Hudson Valley, NY (Cook and Jacoby 1977) = was completed during the beginning of
90	the recent wetting trend (Figure 1; Figure S1). An update lengthening the record of drought
91	history for the Hudson Valley and NYC watershed is necessary to better place the recent unusual
92	pluvial conditions in a long-term context.

Here we use nested reconstruction techniques on a network with increased chronology 93 and species replication to lengthen the original NYC watershed drought record by 240 years. 94 95 The new reconstruction is used to place the recent increase in pluvial conditions in context. Analysis of instrumental records indicates a significant shift in rainfall since 2003 (Figure 1; 96 Figure S1). We demonstrate that the recent wetting trend and pluvial, i.e., multiple years marked 97 by unusual rainfall and moist conditions, is an anomaly in NYC's ca 500-year climate history. 98 Placing the current pluvial in a broad context, along with the severe unexplained 1960s drought 99 that preceded it, it is evident that the region will need to be adaptive and flexible to adequately 100 ensure a reliable water supply to the 9.1 million residents of NYC's future. 101

102

#### 103 **2. Methods**

104 *a. Development of the tree ring network* 

105The network of 33 tree-ring records used here is derived from a dendroecological study106from 1999-2004 (Pederson 2005; no. of chronologies = 23) and in-house chronologies

107	(Supplementary Material, Table S1; no. Of chronologies = 10); the seven in-house chronologies
108	are available from the International Tree-Ring Databank (ITRDB,
109	http://www.ncdc.noaa.gov/paleo/treering.html). Chronologies within or adjacent to the Hudson
110	Valley were selected for a potential relationship to growing season Palmer Drought Severity
111	Index (PDSI) and at least 160 years in length were retained as potential climate predictors;
112	segment length has a median of 163 years and ranges from 105-252 years (Supplementary
113	Material, Table S1). Overall, the current tree-ring network in the NYC watershed, composed of
114	33 chronologies and contains three chronologies dating back to 1453 (Table S1, Figure S2), is
115	denser in time and space than all prior reconstructions.
116	Perhaps the most significant advance of the new network is its species composition. Here we
117	take advantage of the biodiversity of in forests in New York State's Hudson Valley to increase
118	spatial and species replication. Recent work suggests that increased species replication could
119	improve climatic reconstructions (García-Suárez et al. 2009; Cook and Pederson 2011), a
120	hypothesis that has found support in a reconstruction of Potomac River flow using nine tree
121	species from the diverse forests of the Appalachian Mountains (Maxwell et al. 2011). Twelve
122	species are used here, including what we believe are four species not previously used for drought
123	reconstruction (Betula lenta, Carya glabra, Quercus rubra, and Quercus velutina), and two
124	species only recently used for drought reconstruction (Carya ovata and Liriodendron tulipifera)
125	(Supplementary Material, Table S1). We will use the term 'novel' when discussing these species
126	not traditionally used in dendroclimatic research. The regional forest is so species rich that there
127	are three species present at 1453 CE in the new network.
128	Standard tree-ring methods were used in the processing and crossdating of all new
129	samples (Fritts 1976; Cook and Kariukstis 1990). The program ARSTAN was used to

130 standardized all raw ring-width series (Cook et al. 2011) with the goal to retain as much longterm variation in ring widths as possible from trees living in close-canopy forests, where tree-to-131 tree competition can obscure the potential climate signal (Cook and Peters 1981; Pederson et al. 132 2004). We applied the 'Friedman Super Smoother' to reduce the influence of changes in tree 133 competition on annual radial increment (Friedman 1984; Buckley et al. 2010). Occasionally, the 134 Friedman Super Smoother curve trends in opposition to raw ring-width trends at the end of a 135 time-series, resulting in ring index inflation or deflation. Series with these end-fitting issues were 136 detrended using a two-thirds cubic smoothing spline (Cook and Peters 1981). Prior to detrending, 137 138 series were transformed using the adaptive power transformation and stabilized using the 'rbar' weighted stabilization method, where three or more trees are present for nearly all of the 139 chronology length. A combination of the rbar weighted and one-third spline methodology was 140 applied to records with greater replication at the beginning of the chronology (Cook and Peters 141 1997). A robust biweight mean function was used to calculate series index values (Cook 1985). 142 Chronology quality was interpreted using expressed population signal (EPS) (Wigley et 143 al. 1984). Median network EPS is 0.950 and ranges from 0.860 to 0.981. To maximize usable 144 chronology length, the cutoff for each record was the first year in which EPS was  $\geq 0.85$ . The 145 median year of earliest usable chronology within the network is 1780, with a range from 1515-146 1852 (Supplemental Material, Table S1). Only ARSTAN chronologies were used as potential 147 climate predictors. Autoregressive modeling reduces much of the stochastic or endogenous 148 149 disturbances reflected in the tree rings of surviving trees such that the ARSTAN chronology is useful for the examination of long-term climate variability (Cook 1985). All tree-ring collections 150 showed considerable instances of abrupt changes in ring width that are indicative of changes in 151 152 tree-to-tree competition.

153

# 154 b. Reconstruction of Hydroclimate

The target dataset for reconstruction was the instrumental PDSI for NOAA's New York 155 State's Climate Division 5 (from the National Climate Data Center's Climate Data Online portal 156 http://www7.ncdc.noaa.gov/CDO/cdo), which represents the Hudson Valley. Average May-157 August PDSI within the Hudson Valley division was reconstructed based upon the common 158 response of the tree-ring network. Ring index of the current year (t) and prior year (t+1) was 159 used for each chronology because current-year ring widths are often comprised of energy gained 160 161 during the prior year (Trumbore et al. 2002; Kagawa et al. 2006). Considering this physiological lag, 66 candidate predictors entered the regression matrix (33 current-year predictors and 33 162 lagged predictors). Predictor selection was based upon a one-tailed correlation (because of the 163 requirement of a positive relation between ring widths and PDSI) at p = 0.05. The Spruce Glen 164 Tsuga canadensis record did not pass the selection criteria so that 32 of the 33 original 165 chronologies were used as predictors. The final set of predictors was reduced to orthogonal 166 principle components (PCs) using principle component analysis (PCA). Following these criteria, 167 64 predictors (current and prior year ring index as a predictor) were retained for reconstruction. 168 The resulting time series from PCA entered into the regression against the instrumental PDSI 169 data. 170

Because the common usable chronology length of the current network is 1852-1982, a nesting procedure was used to extend the length of the drought reconstruction (Meko 1997; Cook et al. 2003). Through this procedure, shorter chronologies are dropped as potential predictors through an iterative process and new reconstruction nests are created beyond the common period. Twenty 'backwards nests' were created for our drought reconstruction. Similarly, 'forward nests' were created for the time between 1981 and 2004 by dropping chronologies collected after 1981
but before more recent collections; 2004 is the last year of collections by this lab in the Hudson
Valley. A total of six forward nests were created using chronologies from the 1982-2004 period.
The reduction of error (RE) and coefficient of efficiency (CE) statistics were used to verify
model skill of all backward and forward reconstruction nests. Positive RE and CE values indicate
predictive skill (Fritts 1976; Wigley et al. 1984; Cook et al. 1994).

The reconstruction here was built upon the 1895-1981 period, which is the common period 182 between all chronologies and the instrumental data. Investigation into the stability of all 183 reconstruction nests was conducted through two split calibration-verification tests. The 184 meteorological data were split into  $1/3^{rd}$  and  $2/3^{rd}$  portions for the first calibration-verification 185 test and then reversed the calibration and verification periods for a second test (Table S2). 186 Additional years of meteorological data gained through forward nesting (because of an increased 187 common period of more recent years between tree-ring records and meteorological data) were 188 used in the development of the reconstruction as well as all calibration-verification tests. Any 189 reconstruction nest that accounted for less than 30% of the annual drought variation from the 190 instrumental record or any test that produced negative RE and CE statistics were considered 191 insufficient for reconstruction and omitted from the final reconstruction. 192

193

#### 194 c. Assessing Historical Hydroclimate Variability

Drought and pluvial events were quantified and ranked following Gray et al.'s (2011) adaptation of Biondi et al. (2002; 2005), except that we focus only on drought and pluvial events of three or more consecutive years to examine extended events. We calculated the duration or length, the magnitude (sum of the departure values from the median) and intensity (sum of the departure values from the median divided by the duration) of each run. Each drought and pluvial event is ranked, where the larger the departure from the median or the greater the intensity of the event, the lower the event is initially ranked. The magnitude and intensity value ranks for each event are then added together. Events with the largest combined score are considered more severe.

204

# 205 *d. Assessing Species Contributions to Hydroclimatic Reconstructions*

We calculated the relative explained variance of each species to investigate the value of 206 each to the reconstruction following Frank and Esper (2005). Absolute values of beta weights, or 207 the standard regression coefficient that represents predictor loading in principal component 208 regression analysis, were summed for each chronology when the current year's (t) and previous 209 year's growth (t+1) passed predictor selection criteria. The summed value for each chronology 210 was divided by the sum of all beta weights and then again by 100. For species with multiple 211 chronologies (eight species), minimum, maximum and average relative variance explained 212 (AREV) was also calculated. Our analysis is intended to further explore the importance of 213 species replication, chronology replication and chronology quality in dendroclimatic research. 214 Investigation of all permutations of 12 species and 32 chronologies is beyond the scope of this 215 paper and is therefore limited to a few ranges of species replication, chronology replication and 216 chronology quality. Chronology quality for this purpose is defined as the annual variance 217 218 accounted for by each chronology of the instrumental data being reconstructed. Where there are duplicate chronologies for a species, each chronology is ranked by the amount of annually 219 accounted variance with the highest (lowest) amount of variance considered the "best" ("worst") 220 221 (See Table 2).

222

### 223 **3. Results**

*a. Reconstruction modeling and spatial representation* 

Ring width variation for the common period between all tree-ring records and the 225 instrumental PDSI data (1852-1981) accounted for 66.2% of the annual variation of average 226 May-August PDSI (Figure 2; Supplemental Table S2). Most nests reconstructing hydroclimate 227 before 1852 account for nearly 50% of annual variation in instrumental PDSI (i.e.,  $r^2$  for the 228 1602-1661 nest = 49.6%). By our criteria, the 1515-1530 nest fails when it accounts for only 229 26.9% of the annual variance in the instrumental record. The first usable nest is the 1531-1556 230 nest, which accounts for 44.1% of the annual average of May-August instrumental PDSI 231 between 1895 and 1981. Going forward past 1981 and up to the 2002 nest, tree rings account for 232 49.3% or more of instrumental PDSI. The 2002 nest, composed of only four chronologies, 233 accounts for 33.8% of annual drought variation while the 2003 nest accounts for 31.5% (Table 234 S2). RE and CE statistics are positive for all nests between 1531 and 2002, although verification 235 RE and CE both drop below 0.100 for the 1999 and 2000 nests indicating a weakening of skill. 236 Meteorological data is added after 2003 so that the final reconstruction of drought in the NYC 237 238 watershed covers 1531-2011 CE (Figure 3).

The use of novel species for drought reconstruction appears to have improved model skill. While more commonly used species like *Juniperus viginiana*, *Quercus alba*, *Quercus montana* and *Tsuga canadensis* have higher AREV, novel species had among the highest amounts of relative variance explained (Table 1). *Liriodendron tulipifera* had the second highest AREV (5.31), just behind *Tsuga canadensis* (5.69). Similarly, *Carya glabra* performed nearly as well as *Juniperus viginiana* (AREV = 4.05 vs. 4.39, respectively) and *Betula lenta* performed

nearly as well as *Quercus stellata* (AREV = 3.38 vs. 3.72, respectively). *Quercus alba* and 245 Quercus montana AREV values are lower than one might expect given their usefulness in 246 previous reconstructions. This is mainly due to the use of a chronology of each species that is 247 relatively weak. For example, four of the five Quercus montana chronology AREV values are 248 >2.9 with a maximum value of 5.29. In comparison, the weakest *Ouercus montana* AREV value 249 is 0.06 (Table 1). A similar situation is seen with *Quercus rubra*. Three of the four chronologies 250 here have AREV >2.1 while the weakest chronology has an AREV of 1.3. We also investigated 251 the efficacy of these novel species by comparing calibration and verification statistics for the 252 253 1895-1981 common period between 'traditional' and novel species (Table 2). Novel species perform nearly as well on their own when reconstructing average May-Aug instrumental PDSI as 254 the traditional species. 255

Despite the often observed limitations of tree-ring data to effectively capture wet years 256 and pluvial events (Fritts 1976), the tree-ring network here captures wet years and pluvial events 257 within the instrumental record nearly as well as drought events (Figure 2). It should be noted that 258 two of the three pluvial events after 1981 are not captured as well, which could limit the 259 interpretation of reduced pluvial events during the prior four centuries (discussed below). 260 However, the tree ring based reconstruction indicates wet conditions or captures the event pattern 261 for 64.3% of the 14 pluvial events in the instrumental record above the 1895-2011 median  $\geq 2$ 262 years in duration (1897-1898, 1901-1903, 1916-1917, 1919-1920, 1927-1928, 1937-1938, 1945-263 1948, 1950-1953, 1960-1961, 1967-1969, 1971-1977, 1982-1984, 1989-1990, 1996-1998). Two 264 of the five events where the tree rings underperform (1982-1984 and 1996-1998) are well above 265 the median. The remaining pluvial events are smaller excursions from the median. This 266 267 underperformance could be the result of reduced replication, the network being dominated by

268 denroecological collections, or time-varying standardization. It would seem the most important factor here is the time-varying standardization. First, chronology replication only drops from 32 269 to 28 chronologies by 2000 CE. Next, our results actually indicate that reduced chronology 270 replication is less of a problem if species replication is higher (Table 2). Species replication in 271 the tree-ring network after 1981 is still high. Finally, a new study (Pederson et al., in review at 272 Canadian Journal of Forest Research) supports an earlier postulation that site selection might 273 matter less when sampling for hydroclimatic reconstructions in the eastern US (Cook, 1982). The 274 new study indicates that randomly-selected trees, even those from mesic environments, reflect 275 276 annual to decadal hydroclimatic variation over the prior two centuries. So, it seems less likely that the use of dendroeclogical collections is the cause of weaker performance during the 1996-277 1999 pluvial event. Given this evidence and the fact that these events were within the last decade 278 of the tree-ring based reconstruction, it seems that time-varying standardization methods might 279 be the primary reason for the underperformance during two of the last three pluvial events. Time-280 varying standardization reduces the amount of medium-frequency variation at the ends of time-281 series (Melvin and Briffa 2008). In our network, there are only a few periods when multiple 282 chronologies line up in a way so that a loss of medium frequency at the end of a time series could 283 be compounded to underestimate hydroclimatic variation. These periods are: 1660-1700, 1740-284 1760, 1795-1810, 1830-1850, and after 1992. We do note that the sign tests for both calibration-285 verification tests were highly significant (26+/4, z-score: 3.834, p-level = 0.00006 for 1895-286 1924 calibration period; 44+/13-, z-score: 3.974, p-level = 0.00004 for the 1925-1981 calibration 287 period) indicating a strong ability of the network to capture wetter and dryer years and events. 288 Most of the wet years and multi-annual pluvial events in the instrumental record are captured by 289 290 the composite tree-ring record.

291 Not only does the new reconstruction of PDSI represent the NYC watershed, it also represents regional-scale precipitation. Between 1901 and 2006 our reconstruction correlates 292 significantly with April to July precipitation across the northeastern US and southern Canada, 293 with average May-July precipitation providing the strongest correlation (Figure S3). The 294 correlation is strongest ( $r \ge 0.50$ ) across the northern mid-Atlantic region. The strong relationship 295 with growing-season precipitation provides independent evidence that the reconstruction 296 presented here represents hydrometeorological conditions over a significant portion of the 297 northeastern US. 298

299

# 300 *b. Hydroclimate variability over the last five centuries*

The new reconstruction indicates that the 1960s drought remains the most intense drought 301 experienced by the region over the last 481 years (Figures 3, 4; Table S3); only the 7-year 302 droughts starting in 1630 and 1661 approach the 1960s in overall intensity. However, the new 303 drought record shows that seven drought events exceed the duration of the 6-year, mid-1960's 304 drought. All but one of these extended droughts occurred prior to the 20<sup>th</sup> century. The average 305 drought event length for the entire record is 5.2 years, while the average drought event duration 306 for the 20<sup>th</sup> century is marginally less at 4.8 years. Most importantly, only two drought events of 307 3-years or more in length occurred after 1967 (Figure 4). Over the entire record, the 17<sup>th</sup> century 308 appears to have been the most prone to frequent, high severity drought (Table S3). Yet, the most 309 striking drought era occurs in the mid-16<sup>th</sup> century when a 23-year drought beginning in 1555 310 (ranked 6<sup>th</sup>) occurs only one year after a 5-year drought event (ranked 24<sup>th</sup>) and a decade after the 311 10<sup>th</sup> ranked drought that began in 1543 (Figure 4). Only four positive departures from the long-312 313 term median, representing moister conditions, occur between 1543 and 1577. While 1960s

drought still stands out as significant in the new 500-year record, the 16<sup>th</sup> and 17<sup>th</sup> centuries are dry centuries.

What might be most striking about the new reconstruction, however, is the upward trend 316 towards pluvial conditions since the early-19<sup>th</sup> century (Figures 3, 4; Table S4). Only the 1960's 317 drought interrupts this multi-centennial trend. The multi-centennial trend is punctuated by a 318 series of intense pluvial events after 1967. Two of the top four highest-ranked pluvial events 319 occur between 1971 and 2009 (Table S4). In fact, seven of the 20 highest-ranked pluvial events 320 have occurred since 1901. The 2006 and 1971 pluvial events represent high and extreme soil 321 moisture conditions (average PDSI = 2.36 and 3.80, respectively). Averaged over the 1968-2011 322 period, PDSI has a value of 0.67 despite including 12 negative years and from 2000-2011 has an 323 average of 1.67 despite including 2 negative years. The top two recent pluvial events are only 324 rivaled by the eight-year pluvial beginning in 1827, the nine-year pluvial beginning in 1672 and 325 the eight-year pluvial beginning in 1578 (Table S4). While the duration of positive soil moisture 326 conditions in the most recent pluvial events has been exceeded historically, the predominantly 327 pluvial PDSI conditions since the beginning of the 21<sup>st</sup> century are virtually unrivaled in terms of 328 intensity. 329

To demonstrate this more clearly, we first look at the most recent decades of the reconstruction. The 35-year period from the end of the 1960s drought up to the end of the treering portion of the reconstruction (2003) stands out as a significantly wet era, with a mean ~2.4 standard deviations above that of all other 35-year periods in the reconstruction (Figure 5a). This alone marks the post-drought period as anomalous. However, the years since the end of our reconstruction have been wetter still, standing out as a distinct regime (Figures 1b, S1). We would expect reconstructions from tree-ring chronologies updated to 2011 to exhibit similar

337 jumps in ring-width, but we do not yet have data to verify this shift. We can get some sense of how anomalous the period since the end of the 1960s drought is by adding the most recent nine 338 vears of instrumental data onto the end of the reconstruction (Figure 5b). This period then stands 339 out at around  $\sim$ 3.8 standard deviations above the average of all other 43 year periods within the 340 reconstruction. To determine if this arbitrary or more ad-hoc analysis might have induced some 341 bias, we conducted a continuous analysis to examine how the post-1960s drought era fits in the 342 probability distribution of the last 500 years. Results support the idea that the current pluvial era 343 is anomalous (Figure S4). As the tree-rings are providing a reflection of most pluvial events in 344 345 the instrumental record (Figure 2), we can be pretty sure that the last three to four decades in the New York City watershed have been some of the wettest experienced in the last 500 years. 346

347

#### 348 4. Discussion

The new reconstruction of drought for the NYC watershed highlights two important 349 aspects of regional hydroclimatic history. First, while the 1960's drought is still among the most 350 intense droughts over the last 500 years, it interrupts a multi-centennial trend of increasing 351 moisture availability that has continued through 2011. Second, the new record gives greater 352 insight regarding the spatial extent and severity of the megadroughts during the 1500s and 353 provides greater temporal and spatial insight into droughts during the 1600s. Two other 354 important outcomes of this work are that: 1) an improved depiction of historical droughts and the 355 356 long-term trend of increasing moisture availability should be useful for understanding the complex climate dynamics in the eastern US and 2) the reconstruction's strength appears to be 357 partly derived from high tree species replication. We will detail the implications of the regional 358

359 hydroclimatic history, methodological aspects of the tree-ring based NYC watershed

360 reconstruction, and its potential societal impacts in the following sections.

361

# 362 a. Multi-centennial Trend Towards Pluvial Conditions

One of the most prominent trends in the NYC watershed reconstruction is the general 363 trend towards pluvial conditions since ca 1800. The magnitude of drought events after the 1827 364 pluvial is less than in prior centuries and becomes nearly nil after the 1960's drought (Figure 4a). 365 Perhaps as striking is the trend of reduced drought intensity since the late-18<sup>th</sup> century (Figure 366 4b). The trend of increasing pluvial conditions is not limited to the NYC watershed region either; 367 instead, it appears to be a local expression of a broader hydroclimatic change across the eastern 368 US (Figure 6). Independent analyses have indicated wetter conditions since the late-19<sup>th</sup> and 369 early-20<sup>th</sup> centuries in three separate regions (Stahle et al. 1988; Stahle and Cleaveland 1992, 370 1994; Cook et al. 2010b; McEwan et al. 2011). Here we show that the recent trend of increased 371 wetness in the NYC watershed generally matches five regionally-distinct, tree-ring records of 372 paleodrought drawn from the NADA. Much of the eastern US has been unusually and somewhat 373 persistently wet since the late-1800s. Almost all of these records indicate more pluvial conditions 374 since the late-1950s. The only event that stands out from this large-scale pattern of change is the 375 unusually severe 1960's drought. Since that event, our reconstruction indicates that this region of 376 the northeastern US has been experiencing the strongest pluvial conditions in the eastern US. 377 378 The instrumental record further supports our finding that recent pluvial events in the NYC region are at the upper limit of hydroclimatic variability for the last 500 years. Even though 379 the 2006-2009 pluvial is virtually unrivaled, 2011 goes beyond the 2006-2009 event: the 2011 380

May-Aug average PDSI value is 3.72, including a value of 5.64 for August. The August 2011

382	PDSI value is the highest instrumental calculation for any month since 1895. Further, the only
383	monthly PDSI values in the instrumental record greater than 5.0 occur after 2003 ( $n = 4$ ). And, of
384	the 20 highest monthly PDSI instrumental values, only one occurred prior to 1975 (a value of
385	4.48 in October 1955) — 70% of the 20 wettest months occur after 2000. Both paleo and
386	instrumental records point out that the recent decade of pluvial conditions is at the upper end of
387	hydroclimatic variability over the last 100 and 500 years (Figures 1, 5), which likely accounts for
388	the lack of water emergencies since 2002. Taken at face value, all these data suggest the long-
389	term trend in pluvial conditions is unusual over the last 500 years.
390	The long trend towards today's pluvial conditions in the NYC watershed matches
391	patterns in other parts of the Northern Hemisphere. Notably, increasing and sustained trends in
392	precipitation or pluvial conditions are seen in Bavaria (Wilson et al. 2005), northeastern China
393	(Sheppard et al. 2004), northwestern China (Li et al. 2006; Yin et al. 2008; Zhang et al. 2011),
394	southern England (Büntgen and Tegel 2011); western Mongolia (Davi et al. 2009), Pakistan
395	(Treydte et al. 2006); and the central Rocky Mountains (Knight et al. 2010); trends for northern
396	or 'High' Asia are summarized and shown to be occurring most strongly in the west, with no
397	such trend in monsoonal Asia (Fang et al. 2010). Interestingly, reconstructions at lower latitudes
398	and in some semi-arid regions are trending towards drought after wetter 20 <sup>th</sup> centuries, including
399	Mexico (Cleaveland et al. 2003), eastern and central Mongolia (Pederson et al. 2001; Davi et al.
400	2006), western Turkey (Akkemik et al. 2005; Touchan et al. 2007; Köse et al. 2011),
401	southeastern U.S. (Pederson et al. 2012), western U.S. (Cook et al. 2004; Woodhouse et al. 2005,
402	2010), and southern Vietnam (Buckley et al. 2010). Abrupt decreases in precipitation are more
403	likely to occur in semi-arid and arid regions (Narisma et al. 2007). So, the opposite trend towards

404 pluvial conditions in the perhumid NYC region mirrors patterns seen in more mesic regions of the North Hemisphere. 405

406

426

#### b. Severity and Spatial Extent of Historical Megadroughts 407

The hydroclimatic reconstruction for the NYC watershed reveals significant drought 408 events between 1500 and 1700 CE. We now have evidence that the 16<sup>th</sup> century megadrought 409 (Stahle et al. 2000) extended into the northeastern US (Figs 4, 6). Outside of the Niagara 410 Escarpment records in southern Canada (Buckley et al. 2004), few records are able to convey 411 information regarding the 16<sup>th</sup> century megadrought for the region. For the northeastern US, the 412 16<sup>th</sup> century megadrought is unprecedented over the past five centuries (Figure 7). No other 413 century contains a drought 23 years in duration immediately following two intense droughts 414 (Figure 4). While the new record here fills an important space concerning the spatial extent of 415 the 16<sup>th</sup> century megadrought, it is now apparent that the 16<sup>th</sup> century megadrought is the most 416 coherent drought episode across the eastern US over the last 500 years (Figure 6). 417 Not to be overlooked, however, are the severe and frequent 17<sup>th</sup> century droughts. While 418 not having nearly 40 years of sustained drought, the 17<sup>th</sup> century has six significant droughts 419 after 1632 (Figure 4). Importantly, the new reconstruction indicates the 1633 drought to be of the 420 same magnitude as the 1960s drought (Figure 4a). What is different about the two half-centuries 421 in which these significant droughts occur is that the first half of the 17<sup>th</sup> century contains a 422 greater proportion of drought than the late-20<sup>th</sup> century (Figure 7). Further revealing the aridity 423 of the 17<sup>th</sup> century is the fact that the latter half of the 17<sup>th</sup> century has a greater density of overall 424 drought likelihood than the first half of the 17<sup>th</sup> century making the 17<sup>th</sup> century one of the driest 425 over the last 500 years (Figure 7). Our new record also indicates that the 1661-1667 drought is

more severe (average PDSI = -2.33) than that currently portrayed in NADA (Figure S4) and an investigation of North American drought to the west of our network (Fye et al. 2003). The  $17^{\text{th}}$ century now appears to be a period plagued with frequent and intense droughts.

While the 16<sup>th</sup> century megadrought is well-known in the paleoclimatological record, the 430 mid-17<sup>th</sup> century drought has been primarily documented in other geologic proxies to the west 431 and northwest of our study region (Bégin and Peyette 1988; Wolin 1996; Lichter 1997; Nielsen 432 1998; Loope and Arbogast 2000; Argyilan et al. 2005; Shuman et al. 2009). Only recently was 433 the severity of drought during the 17<sup>th</sup> century highlighted in close proximity to our study region 434 (Nichols 2010; Ireland and Booth 2011). The NYC watershed reconstruction fills in a spatial gap 435 of these records and adds greater temporal detail throughout the 17<sup>th</sup> century. As the 436 dendroclimatological record of drought is pushed further back in time, more precise temporal 437 resolution is revealed for severe droughts like that in the 17<sup>th</sup> century. 438

The high-resolution revelation of severe and frequent droughts in this region prior to 439 1700 CE is important. Previously, the most serious drought was the 1960s drought (Cook and 440 Jacoby 1977; Lyon et al. 2005; Devineni et al. accepted with revision), a drought that NYC 441 adapted to and survived. However, the great frequency of droughts nearly severe as the 1960s 442 drought during the 17<sup>th</sup> century and the overwhelming magnitude of the 23-year long 16<sup>th</sup> 443 century should put political and resource management agencies in the NYC metro region and the 444 greater megalopolis region (Figure S3) on notice: the northeastern US is not a region without 445 severe droughts. In fact, a high-resolution sediment-core record reaching back to ca 500 CE in 446 the lower Hudson Valley indicates that the 16<sup>th</sup> and 17<sup>th</sup> century droughts are not the worst that 447 this region could experience (Pederson et al. 2005). 448

449

#### 450 c. Contribution to Climate Dynamics

The new information on the spatiotemporal patterns of drought in the northeastern U.S. 451 will inform modeling efforts attempting to understand the drivers of climate dynamics for North 452 America. The trend towards highly unusual conditions in the paleo and instrumental records in 453 the last 40 years might be reflections of abrupt climate change. Significant, positive trends in 454 heavy precipitation, wetness, streamflow and soil moisture have been identified in the eastern US 455 during the 20<sup>th</sup> century (Kunkel et al. 1999; Easterling et al. 2000; Groisman et al. 2004; 456 Hodgkins and Dudley 2011). The northeastern portion of the US has, in fact, some of the 457 strongest trends in precipitation intensity, frequency and extreme events (Karl and Knight 1998; 458 Karl et al. 2009; Brown et al. 2010; Min et al., 2011). The increase in pluvial conditions and a 459 new regime in the instrumental record since 2003 (Figs 1, 3-6, S1) only continue trends 460 identified in previous studies. 461

The causes of a shift to a wetter climate in the northeast are difficult to discern (e.g., 462 Seager et al. 2012). Precipitation variations in the region have been linked to variability of the 463 storm tracks over North America and the North Atlantic Ocean (Seager et al. 2012) and also to 464 variations in the position and strength of the Atlantic subtropical high (Stahle and Cleaveland 465 1992; Davis et al. 1997; Hardt et al. 2010; Seager et al. 2012), although the mechanisms for 466 variations of the high are unclear. While the NYC watershed drought reconstruction is 467 significantly and positively correlated to January sea surface temperatures from 1948-2011 468 (Supplemental Fig S6), these patterns resemble those forced by the atmospheric flow anomalies 469 and seem to be unlikely to have actually caused the atmospheric flow anomalies that control 470 precipitation variations (Seager et al. 2012). There is an apparent association of our 471 reconstruction with the northern Atlantic Ocean from January through March (Fig S5). However, 472

473 a correlation from 1531-2001 between the NYC warm-season reconstruction and a winter NAO reconstruction (Cook et al. 2002) shows virtually no correlation (r = 0.14). There is also an 474 association with the eastern Pacific Ocean in February that fades by April (Fig S5) and 475 correlation in March that suggests a link to the Gulf Stream; the Gulf Stream association is 476 similar to a finding in Joyce et al. (2009). Regardless, the causes of the recent hydroclimatic 477 variability remain poorly known and are possibly complex and multifaceted. Immediately after 478 the 1960s drought it was observed that the event was likely the result of "multiple and 479 interlocking causes" (Namias 1966, pg. 553). A search for the causes of droughts and pluvials in 480 the NYC region will require careful attention to human-induced climate change, non-linearities 481 or asymmetries in the climate system (Gong et al. 2011), the interaction between multiple, large-482 scale climate systems over the northeastern US (Archambault et al. 2008; Budikova 2008), and 483 the influences of a variety of modes of climate variability including ones that are not forced by 484 the ocean (see Cook et al. 2010a). 485

486

#### 487 *d. Implications for Tree-ring Reconstructions in Humid Regions*

As expected by inference (García-Suárez et al. 2009; Cook and Pederson 2011) and 488 evidenced in application (Maxwell et al. 2011), increased species replication appears to improve 489 reconstruction models (Table 4). From the exploration of the influence of chronology replication, 490 chronology quality and species replication on tree-ring based reconstructions, it is interesting to 491 492 note that: 1) a reconstruction composed of only the best and worst chronologies of duplicated species (two chronologies/species for a total of = 16 chronologies) or all species allowing for 493 only the worst two chronologies of duplicated species (n = 20) performed nearly as well as the 494 495 full network (n = 32); 2) a reconstruction composed of the best chronology from the 10 best

496 species outperforms the best 10 overall chronologies; and 3) the best chronology from the eight best species (n=8) performs nearly as well as using all chronologies from traditional 497 dendroclimatological species in the region (n = 16) (Table 1). Results here suggest that species 498 replication is important in reconstructing hydroclimate in humid, closed-canopy environments. 499 With the on-going functional extinction of *Tsuga canadensis* (Orwig and Foster 1998; 500 Bonneau et al. 1999; Orwig et al. 2008), one of the most important tree species for paleoclimatic 501 research in eastern North America, and the expected increase in the loss of tree species, it is 502 important to identify other species that could replace climatically-sensitive species like *Tsuga* 503 504 *canadensis* for future work. Results here indicate that *Liriodendron tulipifera* is nearly an ideal replacement for *Tsuga canadensis*, especially given the recent discovery of it living >500 years 505 (Pederson 2010) (Supplemental Material). Our findings indicate Betula lenta, Carva glabra and 506 Quercus rubra as useful 'novel' species for paleohydroclimatic research (Supplemental 507 Material). In fact, comparison of PDSI reconstruction using only 'Traditional' versus 'Novel' 508 species shows little difference in the performance of the two groupings (Table 2). The 509 differences that do occur in the resulting reconstruction do not seem to consistently favor one 510 grouping of species versus the other (Fig S7). While these 'novel' species generally do not live 511 as long as Tsuga canadensis (Eastern OLDLIST, 2011), the nested reconstruction approach 512 makes shorter chronologies useful for paleoclimatic research. Continued exploration of species 513 in the diverse eastern North American forest for maximum ages and climatic sensitivity should 514 515 help future dendroclimatological research as species are lost, either functionally or permanently. 516

517 e. Implications for NYC Water Supply

518 Current supply levels for NYC are anomalous within the context of the last 500 years. NYC currently enjoys a water supply surplus and rotates its water demand among three 519 watershed systems - the Croton, Catskill, and Delaware watersheds - from year to year (NYC 520 DEP 2010). It might appear thus that NYC possesses a surplus of water use rights that might be 521 better allocated to downstream users of the basin in Delaware, New Jersey, and Pennsylvania. 522 However, we argue that a reallocation of NYC's water rights may well put metropolitan water 523 supply at risk, should the current trend towards strong pluvial conditions come to an end. In fact, 524 forecasts of future precipitation indicate continued wetting during winter, but drying during the 525 summer (Hayhoe et al. 2007). The gains in water conservation and efficiency made by NYC 526 during a time of comparative abundance are admirable (from a per capita consumption peak of 527 788.5 liters per day (LPD) in 1988 to a low in 2009 of 476.2 LPD, a reduction of 40%) (NYC 528 DEP 2010), and may turn out to have been prescient if and when NYC's 'water boom' comes to 529 an end. We suggest the value in framing NYC's current condition as a 'water boom' rather than 530 a 'water surplus', and note the insight from natural resource economics that benefits accrued 531 from resource booms are better saved than consumed (because reducing consumption rates is 532 much more painful and difficult than reducing rates of saving) (Collier 2010). To its credit NYC 533 has already done much to avoid a consumption boom in water resources, and we hope that the 534 context provided in this study will demonstrate the importance of 'saving' the current abundance 535 of water resources – perhaps through facilitating watershed restoration and improving the 536 537 provision of ecosystem services by the Delaware and Catskill watersheds, or through short-term leases of NYC's current surplus with the revenues invested in water infrastructure – while the 538 boom lasts. Ephemeral though it may turn out to be, the capacity for NYC to act as a buffer 539

within a collaborative regional network of water supply and demand (and collect revenue in theprocess) is an opportunity not to be missed.

542

543 **5. Summary** 

Here we present a well-replicated reconstruction of hydroclimate for the NYC region 544 from 1531-2011. The new reconstruction reveals an upward trend towards more pluvial 545 conditions since ca 1800 for a significant portion of the northeastern US, a trend that is manifest 546 over much of temperate eastern North America. This trend is currently punctuated by an unusual, 547 43-year pluvial and supports instrumental data indicating that the last two decades are unusual in 548 nature. With greater chronology replication in the 16<sup>th</sup> and 17<sup>th</sup> centuries than previous regional 549 reconstructions, the new record reveals a high frequency of droughts during the 16<sup>th</sup> and 17<sup>th</sup> 550 551 centuries that are similar in intensity to the 1960's drought, the drought of record in the instrumental data. We now have evidence that the well-known 16<sup>th</sup> century megadrought likely 552 occurred over much of the northeastern US. Here, the 16<sup>th</sup> century is characterized by an 553 unprecedented 23-year drought that follows in short succession two other significant drought 554 events. Perhaps just as important, the 17<sup>th</sup> century is characterized by six severe drought events 555 after 1633. In a 500-year context, the 20<sup>th</sup> century and the sustained and repeated pluvial events 556 over the last 43 years mask the real likelihood for severe and significant drought in the greater 557 NYC region. Water supply systems for millions of people need to be viewed as vulnerable to 558 severe and potentially frequent drought. With this perspective, we suggest that the current 559 conditions within the NYC watershed be seen as a water boom, not surplus. During booms it 560 might be best to focus management on saving the current abundance of water resources. 561

562

# 563 Acknowledgements

- 564 This work was partially supported by a fellowship provided to NP by the U.S. Department of
- 565 Energy Global Change Education Program. Critical feedback by C. Leland, D. Martin and C.
- 566 Ummenhofer improved earlier versions of this manuscript. This is Lamont-Doherty Earth
- 567 Observatory Contribution XXXX.

568

#### 569 Literature Cited

- 570 Akkemik, U., N. Dağdeviren, and A. Aras, 2005: A preliminary reconstruction (A.D. 1635-2000)
- of spring precipitation using oak tree rings in the western Black Sea region of Turkey.

572 International Journal of Biometeorology, **49**, 297–302.

- Archambault, H. M., L. F. Bosart, D. Keyser, and A. R. Aiyyer, 2008: Influence of large-scale
- flow regimes on cool-season precipitation in the Northeastern United States. *Monthly Weather Review*, 136, 2945-2963.
- 576 Argyilan, E. P., S. L. Forman, J. W. Johnston, and D. a Wilcox, 2005: Optically stimulated
- 577 luminescence dating of late Holocene raised strandplain sequences adjacent to Lakes
- 578 Michigan and Superior, Upper Peninsula, Michigan, USA. *Quaternary Research*, 63, 122–
  579 135.
- Biondi, F., T. J. Kozubowski, and A. K. Panorska, 2002: Stochastic modeling of regime shifts.
   *Climate Research*, 23, 23–30.
- Biondi, F., T. J. Kozubowski, and A. K. Panorska, 2005: A new model for quantifying climate
  episodes. *International Journal of Climatology*, 25, 1253–1264.
- Bonneau, L. R., K. S. Shields, and D. L. Civco, 1999: A technique to identify changes in

hemlock forest health over space and time using satellite image data. *Biological Invasions*,
1, 269–279.

- Brown, P. J., R. S. Bradley, and F. T. Keimig, 2010: Changes in Extreme Climate Indices for the
   Northeastern United States, 1870–2005. *Journal of Climate*, 23, 6555–6572.
- 589 Buckley, B. M., R. J. S. Wilson, P. E. Kelly, D. W. Larson, and E. R. Cook, 2004: Inferred
- summer precipitation for southern Ontario back to AD 610, as reconstructed from ring
- 591 widths of Thuja occidentalis. *Canadian Journal of Forest Research*, **34**, 2541–2553.

592	Buckley, B. M. and Coauthors, 2010: Climate as a contributing factor in the demise of Angkor,
593	Cambodia. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of
594	<i>America</i> , <b>107</b> , 6748–6752.
595	Burns, D., J. Klaus, and M. Mchale, 2007: Recent climate trends and implications for water
596	resources in the Catskill Mountain region, New York, USA. Journal of Hydrology, 336,
597	155–170.
598	Bégin, Y., and S. Peyette, 1988: Dendroecological evidence of lake-level changes during the last
599	three centuries in subarctic Quebec. Quaternary Research, 30, 210-220.
600	Budikova, D., 2008: Effect of the Arctic Oscillation on precipitation in the eastern USA during
601	ENSO winters. Climate Research, 37, 3-16.
602	Büntgen, U., and W. Tegel, 2011: European tree-ring data and the Medieval Climate Anomaly.
603	Medieval Climate Anomaly, Eds. E. Xoplaki, D. Fleitmann, H. Diaz, L. Von Gunten, and T.
604	Kiefer, Vol. 19 of, 14–15, PAGES.
605	Büntgen, U. and Coauthors, 2011: 2500 years of European climate variability and human

- 606 susceptibility. *Science*, **331**, 578–582.
- 607 Cleaveland, M. K., D. W. Stahle, M. D. Therrell, J. Villanueva-Diaz, and B. T. Burns, 2003:

Tree-ring reconstructed winter precipitation and tropical teleconnections in Durango,

- 609 mexico. *Climatic Change*, **59**, 369–388.
- 610 Collier, P., 2010: The Plundered Planet Why We Must--and How We Can--Manage Nature for
- 611 *Global Prosperity*. Oxford University Press, New York,.
- 612 Cook, B. I., E. R. Cook, K. J. Anchukaitis, R. Seager, and R. L. Miller, 2010a: Forced and
- 613 unforced variability of twentieth century North American droughts and pluvials. *Climate*
- 614 *Dynamics*, **37**, 1097–1110.

- 615 Cook, E. R., 1982: Tree-ring data networks: comment. In M. K. Hughes, P. M. Kelly, J. R.
- 616 Pilcher, and V. C. LaMarche Jr. (Eds.), *Climate from Tree Rings* (First Ed.). London:
- 617 Cambridge University Press. pp. 6-7
- Cook, E. R., 1985: A time series analysis approach to tree ring standardization. The University of
   Arizona. Dissetation.
- Cook, E., and G. Jacoby, 1977: Tree-ring-drought relationships in the Hudson Valley, New
  York. *Science*, **198**, 399–401.
- 622 Cook, E. R., and K. Peters, 1981: The Smoothing Spline: A New Approach to Standardizing
- Forest Interior Tree-Ring Width Series for Dendroclimatic Studies. *Tree-Ring Bulletin*, **41**,
  45–53.
- Cook, E. R., and G. C. Jacoby, 1983: Potomac River streamflow since 1730 as reconstructed by
   tree rings. *Journal of climate and applied meteorology*, 22, 1659–1672.
- 627 Cook, E. R., and L. A. Kariukstis, 1990: Methods of Dendrochronology: Applications in the
- 628 Environmental Sciences. Eds. E.R. Cook and L.A. Kariukstis. Kluwer Academic,
- 629 Dordrecht.
- Cook, E. R., and K. Peters, 1997: Calculating unbiased tree-ring indices for the study of climatic
  and environmental change. *The Holocene*, 7, 361–370.
- Cook, E. R., and P. J. Krusic, 2004: The North American Drought Atlas. *Lamont-Doherty Earth Observatory and the National Science Foundation*.
- 634 http://iridl.ldeo.columbia.edu/SOURCES/.LDEO/.TRL/.NADA2004/.pdsi-atlas.html
- 635 (Accessed November 8, 2011).

- 636 Cook, E. R., and N. Pederson, 2011: Uncertainty, Emergence, and Statistics in
- 637 Dendrochronology. Dendroclimatology, Developments in Paleoenvironmental Research,
- Eds. M.K. Hughes, T.W. Swetnam, and H.F. Diaz, Vol. 11 of, 77–112.
- 639 Cook, E. R., K. R. Briffa, and P. D. Jones, 1994: Spatial regression methods in
- 640 dendroclimatology: A review and comparison of two techniques. *International Journal of*
- 641 *Climatology*, **14**, 379–402.
- 642 Cook, E. R., R. D. D'Arrigo, and M. E. Mann, 2002: A Well-Verified, Multiproxy
- Reconstruction of the Winter North Atlantic Oscillation Index since A.D. 1400. *Journal of*
- 644 *Climate*, **15**, 1754–1764.
- 645 Cook, E. R., P. J. Krusic, and P. D. Jones, 2003: Dendroclimatic signals in long tree-ring
- chronologies from the Himalayas of Nepal. *International Journal of Climatology*, 23, 707–
  732.
- Cook, E. R., D. M. Meko, D. W. Stahle, and M. K. Cleaveland, 1999: Drought reconstructions
  for the continental United States. *Journal of Climate*, 12, 1145–1162.
- 650 Cook, E. R., P. J. Krusic, R. H. Holmes, and K. Peters. 2011. Program ARSTAN Ver.41d 10.5,
- http://www.ldeo.columbia.edu/tree-ring-laboratory/resources/software (Accessed November
  29, 2011).
- 653 Cook, E. R., C. A. Woodhouse, C. M. Eakin, D. M. Meko, and D. W. Stahle, 2004: Long-term
- aridity changes in the western United States. *Science (New York, N.Y.)*, **306**, 1015–1018.
- 655 Cook, E., R. Seager, R. R. J. Heim, R. S. Vose, C. Herweijer, and C. A. Woodhouse, 2010b:
- 656 Megadroughts in North America: placing IPCC projections of hydroclimatic change in a
- long-term palaeoclimate context. *Journal of Quaternary Science*, **25**, 48–61.

- 658 Cook, E. R., and Coauthors, 2008: North American Summer PDSI Reconstructions, Version 2a.
- 659 *IGBP PAGES/World Data Center for Paleoclimatology Data Contribution Series # 2008-*
- 660 046. NOAA/NGDC Paleoclimatology Program. http://www.ncdc.noaa.gov/paleo/pdsi.html
- 661 (Accessed November 11, 2011).
- 662 Davi, N. K., G. C. Jacoby, A. E. Curtis, and N. Baatarbileg, 2006: Extension of Drought Records
- for Central Asia Using Tree Rings: West-Central Mongolia. *Journal of Climate*, **19**, 288–
  299.
- 665 Davi, N. K., G. C. Jacoby, R. D. D'Arrigo, N. Baatarbileg, L. Jinbao, and a E. Curtis, 2009: A
- tree-ring-based drought index reconstruction for far-western Mongolia: 1565-2004.
- 667 International Journal of Climatology, **29**, 1508–1514.
- Davis, R. E., B. P. Hayden, D. a Gay, W. L. Phillips, and G. V. Jones, 1997: The North Atlantic
  Subtropical Anticyclone. *Journal of Climate*, 10, 728–744.
- 670 Devineni, N., U. Lall, N. Pederson, and E. R. Cook, Accepted with revision: Delaware River
- 671 streamflow reconstruction using tree rings: exploration of hierarchical Bayesian regression.
  672 *Journal of Climate*.
- Easterling, D. R., G. A. Meehl, C. Parmesan, S. A. Changnon, T. R. Karl, and L. O. Mearns,
- 2000: Climate extremes: observations, modeling, and impacts. *Science*, **289**, 2068–2074.
- Eastern OLDLIST, 2011: Eastern OLDLIST: a database of maximum tree ages for eastern North
- America. http://www.ldeo.columbia.edu/~adk/oldlisteast/ (Accessed December 1, 2011).
- Fang, K., X. Gou, F. Chen, F. Zhang, Y. Li, and J. Peng, 2010: Comparisons of drought
- variability between central High Asia and monsoonal Asia: Inferred from tree rings.
- 679 Frontiers of Earth Science in China, 4, 277–288.

- Frank, D., and J. Esper, 2005: Characterization and climate response patterns of a high-elevation,
   multi-species tree-ring network in the European Alps. *Dendrochronologia*, 22, 107–121.
- 682 Friedman, J. H., 1984: A variable span smoother. Stanford University. Stanford.
- 683 Fritts, H. C., 1976: *Tree Rings and Climate*. Academic Press, New York.
- Fye, F. K., D. W. Stahle, and E. R. Cook, 2003: Paleoclimatic Analogs to Twentieth-Century
- Moisture Regimes Across the United States. *Bulletin of the American Meteorological Society*, 84, 901-909.
- Gong, G., L. Wang, and U. Lall, 2011: Climatic precursors of autumn streamflow in the
  northeast United States. *International Journal of Climatology*, **31**, 1773–1784.
- Gou, X., Y. Deng, F. Chen, M. Yang, K. Fang, L. Gao, T. Yang, and F. Zhang, 2010: Tree ring
- based streamflow reconstruction for the Upper Yellow River over the past 1234 years.
   *Chinese Science Bulletin*, 55, 4179–4186.
- Gray, S. T., J. J. Lukas, and C. A. Woodhouse, 2011: Millennial-Length Records of Streamflow
- From Three Major Upper Colorado River Tributaries1. *JAWRA Journal of the American Water Resources Association*, 47, 702–712.
- Groisman, P. Y., R. W. Knight, T. R. Karl, D. R. Easterling, B. Sun, and J. H. Lawrimore, 2004:
- 696 Contemporary changes of the hydrological cycle over the contiguous United States: Trends
   697 derived from in situ observations. *Journal of Hydrometeorology*, 5, 64–85.
- 698 García-Suárez, A. M., Butler, C. J., and M. G. L. Baillie, 2009: Climate signal in tree-ring
- 699 chronologies in a temperate climate: A multi-species approach. *Dendrochronologia*, 27,
- 700 183-198.

702	east central North American precipitation based on three coeval Holocene speleothems from
703	southern West Virginia. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 295, 342-348.
704	Hayhoe, K. and Coauthors, 2007: Past and future changes in climate and hydrological indicators
705	in the US Northeast. Climate Dynamics, 28, 381–407.
706	Hodgkins, G. A., and R. W. Dudley, 2011: Historical summer base flow and stormflow trends
707	for New England rivers. Water Resources Research, 47, 1-16.
708	Hornbeck, R. and P. Keskin, 2011: The Evolving Impact of the Ogallala Aquifer: Agricultural
709	Adaptation to Groundwater and Climate. Working Paper. National Bureau of Economic
710	Research, Cambridge, MA.
711	Horton, R., C. Rosenzweig, V. Gornitz, D. Bader, and M. O'Grady, 2009: Climate Risk
712	Information. New York City Panel on Climate Change. New York.
713	Horton, R. M., V. Gornitz, D. A. Bader, A. C. Ruane, R. Goldberg, and C. Rosenzweig. 2011:
714	Climate hazard assessment for stakeholder adaptation planning in New York City. Journal
715	of Applied Meteorology and Climatology, <b>50</b> , 2247-2266.
716	Ireland, A. W., and R. K. Booth, 2011: Hydroclimatic variability drives episodic expansion of a
717	floating peat mat in a North American kettlehole basin. <i>Ecology</i> , <b>92</b> , 11–18.
718	Joyce, T. M., YO. Kwon, and L. Yu, 2009: On the Relationship between Synoptic Wintertime
719	Atmospheric Variability and Path Shifts in the Gulf Stream and the Kuroshio Extension.
720	Journal of Climate, 22, 3177–3192.
721	Kagawa, A., A. Sugimoto, and T. C. Maximov, 2006: 13CO2 pulse-labelling of photoassimilates
722	reveals carbon allocation within and between tree rings. Plant, Cell and Environment, 29,
723	1571–1584.

Hardt, B., H. D. Rowe, G. S. Springer, H. Cheng, and R. L. Edwards, 2010: The seasonality of

- Karl, T. R., and R. W. Knight, 1998: Secular trends of precipitation amount, frequency, and
  intensity in the United States. *Bulletin of the American Meteorological Society*, **79**, 231–
  241.
- 727 Karl, T. R., J. M. Melillo, and T. C. Peterson, 2009: Global Climate Changes in the United
- *States*. Eds. T.R. Karl, J.M. Melillo, and T.C. Peterson. Cambridge University Press, New
   York.
- Knight, T. a, D. M. Meko, and C. H. Baisan, 2010: A bimillennial-length tree-ring reconstruction
  of precipitation for the Tavaputs Plateau, Northeastern Utah. *Quaternary Research*, 73,
- 732 107–117.
- Kunkel, K. E., K. Andsager, and D. R. Easterling, 1999: Long-term trends in extreme
- precipitation events over the conterminous United States and Canada. *Journal of Climate*,
  12, 2515–2527.
- Köse, N., Ü. Akkemik, H. N. Dalfes, and M. S. Özeren, 2011: Tree-ring reconstructions of May–
  June precipitation for western Anatolia. *Quaternary Research*, **75**, 438–450.
- Li, J., X. Gou, E. R. Cook, and F. Chen, 2006: Tree-ring based drought reconstruction for the
- central Tien Shan area in northwest China. *Geophysical Research Letters*, **33**, 1–5.
- Lichter, J., 1997: Radiocarbon Dating of Lake Michigan Beach-Ridge and Dune Development.
- 741 *Quaternary Research*, **48**, 137–140.
- Loope, W. L., and A. F. Arbogast, 2000: Dominance of an ~150-Year Cycle of Sand-Supply
- 743 Change in Late Holocene Dune-Building along the Eastern Shore of Lake Michigan.
- 744 *Quaternary Research*, **54**, 414–422.

745	Lyon, B., N. Christie-Blick, and Y. Gluzberg, 2005: Water shortages, development, and drought
746	in Rockland County, New York. Journal of the American Water Resources Association, 41,
747	1457–1469.

- Maxwell, R. S., A. E. Hessl, E. R. Cook, and N. Pederson, 2011: A multispecies tree ring
- reconstruction of Potomac River streamflow (950–2001). *Water Resources Research*, 47, 1–
  12.
- 751 McEwan, R. W., J. M. Dyer, and N. Pederson, 2011: Multiple interacting ecosystem drivers:
- toward an encompassing hypothesis of oak forest dynamics across eastern North America.
- *Ecography*, **34**, 244–256.
- Meko, D., 1997: Dendroclimatic Reconstruction with Time Varying Predictor Subsets of Tree
   Indices. *Journal of Climate*, 10, 687–696.
- Meko, D. M., and C. A. Woodhouse, 2011: Application of streamflow reconstruction to water
- resources management. *Dendroclimatology*, *Developments in Paleoenvironmental*
- *Research*, Eds. M.K. Hughes, T.W. Swetnam, and H.F. Diaz, Vol. 11, 231–261, Springer
- 759 Netherlands, Dordrecht.
- 760 Melvin, T., and K. Briffa, 2008: A "signal-free" approach to dendroclimatic standardisation.
- 761 *Dendrochronologia*, *26*, 71-86.
- Min, S.-K., X. Zhang, F. W. Zwiers, and G. C. Hegerl, 2011: Human contribution to more intense precipitation extremes. *Nature*, 470, 378-81.
- Namias, J., 1966: Nature and possible causes of the northeastern United States drought during
   1962–65. *Monthly Weather Review*, 94, 543–554.
- Narisma, G. T., J. a Foley, R. Licker, and N. Ramankutty, 2007: Abrupt changes in rainfall
- during the twentieth century. *Geophysical Research Letters*, **34**, 1–5.

768	Nichols, J. E., 2010: Reconstructing Holocene hydroclimate in eastern North America from
769	ombrotrophic peatland sediments. Brown University. Dissertation.
770	Nielsen, E., 1998: Lake Winnipeg coastal submergence over the last three centuries. Journal of
771	Paleolimnology, 19, 335–342.
772	NYC Department of Planning, 2006: New York City Population Projections by Age / Sex &
773	Borough. New York, www.nyc.gov/html/dcp/pdf/census/projections_briefing_booklet.pdf.
774	NYC Department of Environmental Protection, 2010: New York City 2010 Drinking Water
775	Supply and Quality Report. New York,
776	http://www.nyc.gov/html/dep/html/drinking_water/wsstate.shtml.
777	NYC Department of Environmental Protection, 2011: Drought and Water Consumption.
778	http://www.nyc.gov/html/dep/html/drinking_water/droughthist.shtml (Accessed December
779	5, 2011).
780	Orwig, D. A., and D. R. Foster, 1998: Forest response to the introduced hemlock woolly adelgid
781	in southern New England, USA. Journal of the Torrey Botanical Society, 125, 60-73.
782	Orwig, D. a, R. C. Cobb, A. W. D'Amato, M. L. Kizlinski, and D. R. Foster, 2008: Multi-year
783	ecosystem response to hemlock woolly adelgid infestation in southern New England forests.
784	Canadian Journal of Forest Research, <b>38</b> , 834–843.
785	Pederson, D., D. Peteet, D. Kurdyla, and T. Guilderson, 2005: Medieval Warming, Little Ice
786	Age, and European impact on the environment during the last millennium in the lower
787	Hudson Valley, New York, USA. Quaternary Research, 63, 238-249.
788	Pederson, N., 2005: Climatic Sensitivity and Growth of Southern Temperate Trees in the Eastern
789	US: Implications for the Carbon Cycle. Columbia University.

- Pederson, N., 2010: External Characteristics of Old Trees in the Eastern Deciduous Forest.
- *Natural Areas Journal*, **30**, 396–407.
| 792 | Pederson, N., E. R. Cook, G. C. Jacoby, D. M. Peteet, and K. L. Griffin, 2004: The influence of |
|-----|---|
| 793 | winter temperatures on the annual radial growth of six northern range margin tree species.      |
| 794 | Dendrochronologia, 22, 7–29.  |
| 795 | Pederson, N., G. C. Jacoby, R. D. D'Arrigo, E. R. Cook, B. M. Buckley, C. Dugarjav, and R.      |
| 796 | Mijiddorj, 2001: Hydrometeorological Reconstructions for Northeastern Mongolia Derived          |
| 797 | from Tree Rings: 1651–1995. Journal of Climate, 14, 872–881.                                    |
| 798 | Pederson, N. and Coauthors, 2012. Insight into the American Southeast's drought future from its |
| 799 | reconstructed drought past. Environmental Research Letters, 7, 014034.                          |
| 800 | Pederson, N., and Coauthors, In review: Prospects for reconstructing drought using non-         |
| 801 | classical tree-ring data: drought as an important factor of tree growth. Canadian               |
| 802 | Journal of Forest Research.   |
| 803 | Rodionov, S. N., 2004: A sequential algorithm for testing climate regime shifts. Geophysical    |
| 804 | Research Letters, <b>31</b> , 2–5.  |
| 805 | Seager, R., N. Pederson, Y. Kushnir, J. Nakamura, and S. Jurburg, 2012: The 1960s drought and   |
| 806 | the subsequent shift to a wetter climate in the Catskill Mountains region of the New York       |
| 807 | City watershed. Journal of Climate, http://dx.doi.org/10.1175/JCLI-D-11-00518.1                 |
| 808 | Sheppard, P. R., P. E. Tarasov, L. J. Graumlich, KU. Heussner, M. Wagner, H. Sterle, and L.     |
| 809 | G. Thompson, 2004: Annual precipitation since 515 BC reconstructed from living and fossil       |
| 810 | juniper growth of northeastern Qinghai Province, China. Climate Dynamics, 23, 869-881.          |
| 811 | Shuman, B., A. K. Henderson, C. Plank, I. Stefanova, and S. S. Ziegler, 2009: Woodland-to-      |
| 812 | forest transition during prolonged drought in Minnesota after ca. AD 1300. Ecology, 90,         |
| 813 | 2792–2807.  |
|     |   |

- Spierre, S. G., and C. Wake, 2010: *Trends in Extreme Precipitation Events for the Northeastern United States 1948-2007*. Durham.
- 816 Stahle, D. W., and M. K. Cleaveland, 1992: Reconstruction and analysis of spring rainfall over
- the southeastern US for the past 1000 years. *Bulletin of the American Meteorological*
- 818 Society, **73**, 1947–1961.
- 819 Stahle, D. W., and M. K. Cleaveland, 1994: Tree-ring reconstructed rainfall over the
- southeastern USA during the Medieval Warm Period and Little Ice Age. *Climatic Change*,
  26, 199–212.
- 822 Stahle, D. W., M. K. Cleaveland, and J. Hehr, 1988: North Carolina climate changes
- reconstructed from tree rings: AD 372 to 1985. *Science*, **240**, 1517–1519.
- 824 Stahle, D. W., E. R. Cook, M. K. Cleaveland, M. D. Therrell, D. M. Meko, H. D. Grissino-
- Mayer, E. Watson, and and B. H. Luckman, 2000: Tree-ring data document 16th century megadrought over North America. *EOS*, **81**, 121.
- 827 Stockton, C., and G. Jacoby, 1976: Long-term surface-water supply and streamflow trends in the
- Upper Colorado River basin based on tree-ring analyses. *Lake Powell Research Project Bulletin*, 1–70.
- Touchan, R., Ü. Akkemik, M. K. Hughes, and N. Erkan, 2007: May–June precipitation
- reconstruction of southwestern Anatolia, Turkey during the last 900 years from tree rings.
- 832 *Quaternary Research*, **68**, 196–202.
- Treydte, K. S., G. H. Schleser, G. Helle, D. C. Frank, M. Winiger, G. H. Haug, and J. Esper,
- 2006: The twentieth century was the wettest period in northern Pakistan over the past
- millennium. *Nature*, **440**, 1179–1182.

836	Trumbore, S., J. Gaudinski, P. Hanson, and J. Southon, 2002: Quantifying ecosystem-
837	atmosphere carbon exchange with a 14C label. EOS Transactions, 83, 265, 267–268.
838	Wigley, T., K. Briffa, and P. Jones, 1984: On the average value of correlated time series, with
839	applications in dendroclimatology and hydrometeorology. Journal of Climate and Applied
840	<i>Meteorology</i> , <b>23</b> , 201–213.
841	Wilson, R. J. S., B. H. Luckman, and J. Esper, 2005: A 500 year dendroclimatic reconstruction
842	of spring-summer precipitation from the lower Bavarian Forest region, Germany.
843	International Journal of Climatology, 25, 611–630.
844	Wolin, J. A., 1996: Late Holocene lake-level and lake development signals in Lower Herring
845	Lake, Michigan. Journal of Paleolimnology, 15, 19–45.
846	Woodhouse, C., and J. Lukas, 2006: Drought, Tree Rings and Water Management in Colorado.
847	Canadian Water Resources, <b>31</b> , 1–14.
848	Woodhouse, C. A., K. E. Kunkel, D. R. Easterling, and E. R. Cook, 2005: The twentieth-century
849	pluvial in the western United States. <i>Geophysical Research Letters</i> , <b>32</b> , 11–14.
850	Woodhouse, C. a, D. M. Meko, G. M. MacDonald, D. W. Stahle, and E. R. Cook, 2010: A
851	1,200-year perspective of 21st century drought in southwestern North America.
852	Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America, 107,
853	21283–21288.
854	Yin, ZY., X. Shao, N. Qin, and E. Liang, 2008: Reconstruction of a 1436-year soil moisture
855	and vegetation water use history based on tree-ring widths from Qilian junipers in

- 856 northeastern Qaidam Basin, northwestern China. *International Journal of Climatology*, **28**,
- 857 37–53.

- Zhang, Y., Q. Tian, X. Gou, F. Chen, S. W. Leavitt, and Y. Wang, 2011: Annual precipitation
- reconstruction since AD 775 based on tree rings from the Qilian Mountains, northwestern
- 860 China. International Journal of Climatology, **31**, 371–381.
- 861
- 862
- 863

### 863 **Figure Captions**

882

Figure 1 - (a) May to August annual drought area index for the northeast U.S. from 1900-2011 864 (NOAA Northeast Regional Climate Center, Cornell University). ) As determined by the US 865 Drought Monitor (http://droughtmonitor.unl.edu/), black represents moderate and severe drought 866 (PDSI from -2.0 to -3.9) while red represents extreme drought (PDSI  $\leq$  -4.0). (b) Instrumental 867 records of precipitation from 1895-2011 for the northeastern US. The top series (solid, blue line) 868 is the average total annual precipitation while the bottom series (solid, light-blue line with 869 triangles) is average total summer precipitation. Horizontal lines represent average precipitation 870 871 for the regimes detected using the methods of Rodionov (2004). Data are derived from NOAA's National Climatic Data center for Climate Services and Monitoring Division 872 (http://www.ncdc.noaa.gov/temp-and-precip/time-series/). 873 874 Figure 2 – Tree Ring reconstruction (dash-dot orange line) versus average May-Aug 875 instrumental PDSI (solid, blue line) over the common period from 1895-2002. Table S2 contains 876 calibration-verification statistics for all nests. Note: the tree-ring do not fully capture five of the 877 14 pluvial events during the instrumental record, most notably during 1982-1984 and 1996-1999 878 . See results for a discussion of this pattern. 879 880 Figure 3 – Drought history of the NYC watershed region from 1531-2011. The orange, 881

Instrumental data from 2004-2011 (in blue) is tacked onto the end of the tree-ring based

reconstruction (1531-2004). The thick, dot-dash line in the bottom of the figure represents the

smoothed line is a 20-yr spline while the flat, black line represents the long-term median.

885	number of chronologies through time. The dashed grey line highlights replication at five
886	chronologies.
887	
888	Figure 4 – Temporal distribution of (a) magnitude and (b) intensity of pluvial and drought
889	events 3-years or more in duration. Magnitude portrays the cumulative severity of each event
890	while the intensity indicates the average severity of each event. See text for more details.
891	
892	Figure 5 – Probability distributions of (a) 35-year period within the tree-ring based
893	reconstruction from 1531-2003 and (b) 44-year periods within the entire 1531-2011 record. The
894	vertical lines represents 1968-2003 and 1968-2011averages, respectively.
895	
896	Figure 6 – Five records of hydroclimate variability across the eastern US. The new NYC
897	drought reconstruction now provides evidence that the 16 <sup>th</sup> century megadrought (Stahle et al.
898	2000) extended up into the northeastern US and that the trend towards more pluvial conditions is
899	present in five independent records across much of the eastern US. Each line is a 20-yr spline of
900	the each annual record. The dashed line is the mean of each record's mean.
901	
902	Figure 7 – Violin plots for 50-yr segments from 1550-1999 and for the 1895-2003 common
903	period of the reconstructed and meteorological data, showing data quartiles and outliers (box-
904	and-whisker plots) and probability densities (shaded gray areas).
905	

906

Species	No. CRNs	Ave.	Min.	Max.
		AREV	AREV	AREV
T. canadensis	3	5.69	2.98	7.38
L. tulipifera	3	5.31	2.42	7.15
J. virginiana	1	4.39	-	-
C. glabra	3	4.05	2.59	4.95
Q. stellata	1	3.72	-	-
B. lenta	2	3.38	2.59	4.17
P. rigida	1	2.87	-	-
Q. montana	5	2.82	0.06	5.29
Q. rubra	4	2.38	1.30	4.00
Q. alba	5	1.75	0.68	2.48
Q. velutina	3	1.39	1.38	1.52
C. ovata	1	0.62	-	-

906Table 1 – Rank of species used here to reconstruct past drought based upon their average relative

907 explained variance (AREV). See text for calculation details.

909	Table 2. Comparison of various combinations of species replication, chronology replication, and chronology quality ranked by $r^2$ . The
910	end of the table compares reconstruction statistics for chronologies for more commonly-used species (Traditional) versus new or
911	infrequently-used species to dendroclimatology (Novel). We compare the same season and time period (1895-1981). CRNs =
912	chronologies; Spp = species; Dup = duplicated species or species with more than one chronology; B = best; W = worst; Trad. =
913	traditional species. Phrases like "All Spp., Dup. B/W" means that the mix of chronologies is represented by all 12 species with species
914	having more than one chronology represented by the best and worst chronology. "Dup. B/W" means that all duplicated species are
915	represented by their best and worst chronologies. Phrases like "B Spp" means the best species in terms of their explained variance. If
916	followed by 'B' or 'W', they are comprised only of the best or worst chronologies. Finally, "8 B CRNs" simply means the best
917	chronologies according to their individual $r^2$ to the instrumental data.

Mix (No. CRNS)	$r^2$	Pearson r					R	E		СЕ			
	1895-	1895-1924		1925	1925-1981		1895-1924		1925-1981		1895-1924		-1981
	1981	Calib	Veri	Calib	Veri	Calib	Veri	Calib	Veri	Calib	Veri	Calib	Veri
All Spp., Dup. B/W (20)	66.4	0.758	0.788	0.824	0.716	0.575	0.552	0.680	0.423	0.575	0.517	0.680	0.412
All Spp. & CRNs (32)	66.2	0.717	0.781	0.844	0.722	0.515	0.487	0.712	0.405	0.515	0.485	0.712	0.395

Dup. B/W (16)	61.4	0.709	0.744	0.813	0.626	0.503	0.514	0.661	0.304	0.503	0.509	0.503	0.292
All Spp., Dup. W (20)	60.4	0.725	0.730	0.782	0.673	0.525	0.444	0.611	0.271	0.525	0.438	0.611	0.258
8 B Spp, B (8)	58.4	0.697	0.709	0.817	0.442	0.485	0.411	0.668	0.133	0.485	0.384	0.668	0.118
Trad. Spp. (16)	58.3			0.787	0.743			0.620	0.620			0.361	0.349
10 B Spp, B (10)	57.6	0.742	0.766	0.828	0.578	0.550	0.489	0.686	0.254	0.550	0.475	0.686	0.253
All Spp., B (12)	56.6	0.762	0.764	0.835	0.568	0.581	0.484	0.697	0.239	0.581	0.470	0.697	0.238
8 B CRNs (8)	54.6	0.705	0.661	0.781	0.533	0.497	0.380	0.610	0.243	0.497	0.351	0.610	0.230
3 Trad. Spp, 2 B ea (6)	53.5	0.722	0.641	0.737	0.496	0.521	0.374	0.543	0.227	0.521	0.345	0.543	0.214
All Spp., W (12)	49.4	0.771	0.624	0.716	0.622	0.594	0.356	0.513	0.177	0.594	0.350	0.513	0.163
10 B CRNs (10)	48.6	0.708	0.683	0.816	0.544	0.501	0.393	0.666	0.224	0.501	0.365	0.666	0.211
8 W Crns (8)	38.9	0.661	0.500	0.639	0.504	0.436	0.256	0.408	0.168	0.436	0.248	0.408	0.153

Mix (No. CRNS)	r <sup>2</sup>		Pear	Pearson r		RE			CE				
	1981-	1895	-1924	1925-1981		1895-1924 1925-1981		-1981	1895-1924		1925	-1981	
	1895	Calib	Veri	Calib	Veri	Calib	Veri	Calib	Veri	Calib	Veri	Calib	Veri
Novel	58.4	0.642	0.622	0.801	0.416	0.413	0.320	0.641	0.138	0.413	0.294	0.641	0.129
Traditional	58.3	0.765	0.767	0.787	0.743	0.585	0.480	0.620	0.361	0.585	0.474	0.620	0.349
8 W Spp, W (8)	35.8	0.726	0.520	0.638	0.521	0.527	0.266	0.408	0.151	0.527	0.258	0.408	0.137







Figure 1 - (a) May to August annual drought area index for the northeast U.S. from 1900-2011 922 (NOAA Northeast Regional Climate Center, Cornell University). ) As determined by the US 923 Drought Monitor (http://droughtmonitor.unl.edu/), black represents moderate and severe drought 924 (PDSI from -2.0 to -3.9) while red represents extreme drought (PDSI  $\leq$  -4.0). (b) Instrumental 925 records of precipitation from 1895-2011 for the northeastern US. The top series (solid, blue line) 926 927 is the average total annual precipitation while the bottom series (solid, light-blue line with triangles) is average total summer precipitation. Horizontal lines represent average precipitation 928 for the regimes detected using the methods of Rodionov (2004). Data are derived from NOAA's 929 National Climatic Data center for Climate Services and Monitoring Division 930 (http://www.ncdc.noaa.gov/temp-and-precip/time-series/). 931



Figure 2. 



instrumental PDSI (solid, blue line) over the common period from 1895-2002. Table S2 contains 

calibration-verification statistics for all nests. 



Figure 3. 941

Figure 3 – Drought history of the NYC watershed region from 1531-2011. The orange, 942

smoothed line is a 20-yr spline while the flat, black line represents the long-term median. 943

Instrumental data from 2004-2011 (in blue) is tacked onto the end of the tree-ring based 944

reconstruction (1531-2004). The thick, dot-dash line in the bottom of the figure represents the 945

number of chronologies through time. The dashed grey line highlights replication at five 946

chronologies. 947





Figure 4 – Temporal distribution of (a) magnitude and (b) intensity of pluvial and drought
events 3-years or more in duration. Magnitude portrays the cumulative severity of each event
while the intensity indicates the average severity of each event. See text for more details.





## 954 **Figure 5.**

**Figure 5** – Probability distributions of (a) 35-year period within the tree-ring based

- reconstruction from 1531-2003 and (b) 44-year periods within the entire 1531-2011 record. The
- vertical lines represents 1968-2003 and 1968-2011 averages, respectively.









drought reconstruction now provides evidence that the 16<sup>th</sup> century megadrought (Stahle et al.

2000) extended up into the northeastern US and that the trend towards more pluvial conditions is

- present in five independent records across much of the eastern US. Each line is a 20-yr spline of
- the each annual record. The dashed line is the mean of each record's mean.



Figure 7 – Violin plots for 50-yr segments from 1550-1999 and for the 1895-2003 common

970 period of the reconstructed and meteorological data, showing data quartiles and outliers (box-

971 and-whisker plots) and probability densities (shaded gray areas).

# Supplemental Tables

Table S1 - Chronologies used and their statistics for NYC Watershed drought reconstruction.

		CRN Span	No.	EPS	EPS	Yr EPS	Med. Seg.	Comments
Site	Spp		Ser	(Tree)	>0.80	> <b>0.80</b> c	(yrs)	
				а	b			
Albany-Middleburgh, NY	QUlue	1507-	63	0.944	1581	-	168	Live trees = Quercus montana
		2002						dead trees = Q. subgenus
								Leucobalanus species from
								Albany, NY region
Greenbrook Sanctuary,	CAGL	1818-	18	0.883	1847	-	105	
NJ		2000						
Greenbrook Sanctuary,	LITU	1750-	27	0.918	1800	-	152	
NJ		2000						
Goose Egg Forest, NY	QUAL	1666-	35	0.963	1743	-	186	
		2002						
Goose Egg Forest, NY	QUMO	1666-	31	0.958	1746	-	163	

		2002						
Goose Egg Forest, NY	QURU	1799-	34	0.968	1808	-	178	
		2001						
Hunter Island, Bronx, NY	QUST	1773-	26	0.901	1780	-	196	Trees date to British
		2002						occupation during the
								Revolutionary War
Hutchinson Forest, NJ	QUspp	1563-	70	0.964	1645	1602	187	Living trees = <i>Q. alba</i> ; dead
		1982						trees= <i>Q.</i> subgenus
								Leucobalanus species from
								New Brunswick, NJ area
Lake George, NY	QUVE	1836-	32	0.972	1839	-	135	
		2002						
Lisha Kill, NY	CAGL	1753-	27	0.914	1773	-	150	
		2002						
Lisha Kill, NY	QUAL	1816-	23	0.935	1831	-	157	
		2002						

Middleburgh, NY	JUVI	1449-	26	0.860	1525	1515	152	Live & dead wood
		2004						
Mohonk, NY	BELE	1614-	29	0.950	1834	1817	129	Collected in 1974 & 2002
		2002						
Mohonk, NY	CAGL	1740-	30	0.940	1850	1847	152	
		2002						
Mohonk, NY	PIRI	1618-	45	0.967	1670	-	210	Approximate location
		1996						
Mohonk, NY	QUlue	1449-	157	0.981	1550	1531	158	Living portion is Quercus
		2002						montana; the historical
								timbers portion is Q.
								subgenus <i>Leucobalanus</i>
								species from timbers in the
								New Paltz, NY area
Mohonk, NY	QUVE	1793-	27	0.959	1795	-	162	
		2002						

Mohonk, NY	TSCA	1626-	43	0.973	1705	1662	243	Humpty Dumpty talus
		2002						
Mohonk, NY	TSCA	1658-	39	0.963	1735	1691	211	Rock Rift Rd
		2004						
Mohonk, NY	TSCA	1579-	21	0.964	1604	-	252	Spruce Glen
		2000						
Montgomery Place, NY	LITU	1754-	20	0.905	1885	1852	113	
		2002						
Montgomery Place, NY	QUMO	1727-	33	0.941	1830	1805	179	
		2002						
Montgomery Place, NY	QURU	1787-	28	0.928	1870	1839	130	
		2002						
Pack Forest, NY	TSCA	1453-	89	0.970	1557	-	208	Orig. Pack For. TSCA, western
		2003						MA update & historical
								timbers
Prospect Mountain, NY	BELE	1820-	24	0.915	1831	-	121	

		2001						
Prospect Mountain, NY	CAOV	1775-	29	0.939	1830	-	165	
		2001						
Prospect Mountain, NY	QUAL	1659-	32	0.966	1760	-	191	
		2001						
Prospect Mountain, NY	QURU	1816-	28	0.934	1834	-	127	
		2001						
Schenectady, NY	QUVE	1802-	24	0.927	1802	-	167	
		2001						
Schunnemunk Mtn, NY	QUAL	1648-	46	0.928	1700	-	244	Collected in 1983 & 2001
		2001						
Uttertown, NJ	LITU	1732-	28	0.961	1757	-	147	
		2003						
Uttertown, NJ	QUspp	1491-	65	0.956	1516	-	206	Live trees = <i>Q</i> montana;
		2002						historical timbers = Q.
								subgenus <i>Leucobalanus</i>

								species from northeastern NJ
								area
Uttertown, NJ	QURU	1785-	44	0.979	1840	1804	131	
		2001						
Median			30	0.950	17	80	163	

<sup>a</sup> = between tree EPS; <sup>b</sup> = segment where between-tree EPS >0.80; <sup>c</sup> = year when between-tree EPS >0.80 if earlier than <sup>b</sup>

Table S2 - Calibration-validation statistics for the NYC Watershed reconstruction. RE = reduction of error statistic. CE =

coefficient of efficiency. See manuscript for statistic descriptions.

Nesta	No. Crns	r²	Pearson r				I	RE		CE				
								Backwa	ards Nes	t				
		1895-	1895	5-'24	1925	5-'81	189	5-'24	192	5-'81	1895	5-'24	192	5-'81
		1981	Calib.	Veri.	Calib.	Veri.	Calib.	Veri.	Calib.	Veri.	Calib.	Veri.	Calib.	Veri.
1515	2	26.9												
1531	3	44.1	0.754	0.527	0.676	0.504	0.568	0.241	0.458	0.241	0.568	0.207	0.458	0.230
1557	4	45.7	0.796	0.449	0.666	0.476	0.634	0.168	0.444	0.200	0.634	0.131	0.444	0.188
1581	5	48.2	0.757	0.550	0.712	0.515	0.573	0.294	0.507	0.220	0.573	0.263	0.507	0.209
1602	6	49.6	0.751	0.651	0.735	0.676	0.563	0.425	0.541	0.329	0.563	0.419	0.541	0.317
1662	7	53.2	0.732	0.733	0.768	0.678	0.536	0.481	0.590	0.321	0.536	0.475	0.590	0.309

1670	8	55.2	0.787	0.735	0.777	0.747	0.619	0.481	0.604	0.467	0.619	0.475	0.604	0.458
1691	9	57.0	0.791	0.742	0.775	0.744	0.625	0.492	0.641	0.471	0.625	0.487	0.641	0.462
1700	10	57.5	0.781	0.747	0.744	0.722	0.610	0.495	0.599	0.441	0.610	0.490	0.599	0.431
1744	12	58.1	0.776	0.754	0.783	0.714	0.602	0.490	0.612	0.327	0.602	0.484	0.612	0.315
1758	14	58.4	0.773	0.757	0.787	0.702	0.598	0.469	0.620	0.315	0.598	0.463	0.620	0.303
1773	15	59.1	0.771	0.775	0.789	0.690	0.595	0.483	0.623	0.274	0.595	0.478	0.623	0.261
1780	16	58.8	0.771	0.764	0.799	0.700	0.595	0.452	0.639	0.251	0.595	0.447	0.639	0.238
1795	17	58.5	0.771	0.764	0.799	0.688	0.595	0.452	0.638	0.253	0.595	0.447	0.638	0.240
1802	19	60.3	0.789	0.752	0.810	0.682	0.623	0.454	0.657	0.269	0.623	0.448	0.657	0.257
1805	22	64.0	0.788	0.771	0.822	0.710	0.621	0.479	0.685	0.286	0.621	0.473	0.685	0.274
1817	23	63.2	0.794	0.773	0.822	0.719	0.630	0.487	0.676	0.330	0.630	0.481	0.676	0.318
1831	27	63.7	0.778	0.775	0.812	0.731	0.605	0.514	0.659	0.364	0.605	0.509	0.659	0.352

1839	29	64.2	0.743	0.815	0.830	0.730	0.552	0.528	0.689	0.386	0.552	0.523	0.689	0.375
1847	31	64.2	0.717	0.781	0.828	0.731	0.515	0.487	0.686	0.400	0.515	0.482	0.686	0.389
1852 <sup>b</sup>	32	66.2	0.717	0.781	0.844	0.722	0.515	0.487	0.712	0.405	0.515	0.485	0.712	0.395
				Forward Nests										
				Pear	son r			I	RE			(	CE .	
			Calib.	Veri.	Calib.	Veri.	Calib.	Veri.	Calib.	Veri.	Calib.	Veri.	Calib.	Veri.
			Firs	t 3 <sup>rd</sup>	Seco	nd 3 <sup>rd</sup>	Firs	t 3 <sup>rd</sup>	Seco	nd 3 <sup>rd</sup>	Firs	t 3 <sup>rd</sup>	Seco	nd 3 <sup>rd</sup>
1995 <sup>°</sup>	31	57.8	0.712	0.693	0.779	0.719	0.506	0.400	0.606	0.443	0.506	0.396	0.606	0.436
1999 <sup>d</sup>	30	51.3	0.700	0.675	0.736	0.644	0.490	0.379	0.541	0.135	0.490	0.364	0.541	0.098
2000 <sup>e</sup>	28	54.2	0.733	0.670	0.739	0.652	0.537	0.388	0.546	0.090	0.537	0.374	0.546	0.054
2001 <sup>f</sup>	20	49.3	0.673	0.694	0.744	0.647	0.453	0.375	0.554	0.184	0.453	0.359	0.554	0.144
2002 <sup>g</sup>	4	33.8	0.673	0.485	0.629	0.588	0.405	0.207	0.396	0.235	0.405	0.185	0.396	0.194

$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $
--

<sup>a</sup> Date = 1<sup>st</sup> yr of nest; <sup>b</sup>1837 = common period of all 33 CRNS; <sup>c</sup> calibration period = 1895-1995, calibration-verification periods = 1895-1928, 1929-1995; <sup>d</sup> calibration period = 1895-1999, calibration-verification periods = 1895-1930, 1931-1999; <sup>e</sup> calibration period = 1895-2000, calibration-verification periods = 1895-1931, 1932-2000; <sup>f</sup> calibration period = 1895-2001, calibration-verification periods = 1895-1932, 1933-2001; <sup>g</sup> calibration period = 1895-2002, calibration-verification periods = 1895-1933, 1934-2002; <sup>h</sup> calibration period = 1895-2003, calibration-verification periods = 1895-1934, 1935-2003.

Beginning Year	Duration	Magnitude	Intensity	Score
1962-1967	6	-18.87	-3.14	69
1661-1667	7	-16.30	-2.33	66
1630-1636	7	-15.09	-2.16	63
1767-1773	7	-13.40	-1.91	60
1748-1750	3	-7.76	-2.59	58
1555-1577	23	-32.48	-1.41	58
1697-1700	4	-8.51	-2.13	56
1685-1692	8	-11.92	-1.49	56
1647-1651	5	-9.17	-1.83	56
1543-1545	3	-6.56	-2.19	53

Table S3 – Top-10 drought events in the NYC Watershed since 1531.

Beginning Year	Duration	Magnitude	Intensity	Score
1827-1834	8	23.26	2.91	69
2006-2009*	4	15.21	3.80	67
1672-1680	9	17.41	1.93	65
1971-1976	6	14.15	2.36	64
1578-1584	8	15.27	1.91	63
1751-1756	6	12.22	2.04	59
1807-1815	9	13.60	1.51	50
1538-1542	5	8.52	1.70	49
1889-1892	4	7.32	1.82	49
1901-1907	7	10.7	1.53	48

Table S4 – Top-10 pluvial events in the NYC Watershed since 1531.

\* = contains instrumental data

## **Supplemental Figures**



Fig S1 – Instrumental records of precipitation from 1895-2011 for the Hudson Valley of New York State. The top series (solid blue line) is average total annual precipitation while the bottom series (solid light blue line with triangles) is average total summer precipitation. Horizontal lines represent average precipitation for the regimes detected using the methods of Rodionov (2004). Data are derived from NOAA's National Climatic Data center for Climate Services and Monitoring Division (http://www.ncdc.noaa.gov/temp-and-precip/time-series/).



Fig S2 – Chronology network through time in the NYC Watershed.



Fig S3 - Spatial correlation of reconstructed May-Aug PDSI versus May-Jul precipitation. Correlation conducted using KNMI Climate explorer (http://climexp.knmi.nl/) against CRU 3.1 precipitation from 1901-2006.



Fig S4 – Distribution of multi-year averages of NYC PDSI (expressed as Z-scores) from 1531-2011. Data are expressed as Z-scores. Blue ribbon represents the most recent period (i.e., the most recent X-year average up to 2011). The most recent period is increasingly anomalous in the broader climate context (i.e., a trend of increasing Z-score) moving back from 5-year to about 45-year averages, where the average incorporates the 1960s drought.



Fig S5 – Spatial pattern of drought across North America from 1661-1667. Adapted from the North American Drought Atlas (Cook et al. 1999; Cook and Krusic 2004; Cook and al. 2008; http://www.ncdc.noaa.gov/cgi-bin/paleo/pd08plot.pl).



Fig S6 – Correlation between the NYC watershed drought reconstruction and average January, February, March and April sea-level pressure data from 1948-2009 (Kalnay et al. 1996). Adapted from the KNMI Climate explorer (http://climexp.knmi.nl/).



Fig S7 – Comparison of PDSI reconstruction using only 'Traditional Species' versus 'Novel Species' over the 1836-1981 common period. The two series are significantly correlated (r = 0.719) and, while there are some disagreements during four pluvial events, differences do not seem consistent; one reconstruction is not consistently higher (lower) than the other

#### **Supplemental Text**

#### **Implications for Tree-ring Based Reconstructions in Mesic Regions**

We found that *Liriodendron tulipifera* was found to be one of the best species to reconstruct hydroclimate, a finding similar in the reconstruction of the Potomac River (Maxwell et al. 2011). *Liriodendron tulipifera* has two traits that make it nearly an ideal replacement of *Tsuga canadensis*. First, its AREV value is nearly equal to *Tsuga canadensis* (Table 1). However, the next trait that makes *Liriodendron tulipifera* an especially appealing replacement species is that it has recently been documented as often living longer than 400 years (Eastern OLDLIST 2011). In fact, the new documented maximum age for *Liriodendron tulipifera* of 512 years is from a hollow tree where only half of its radius was recovered (Pederson 2010). It would not be surprising if *Liriodendron tulipifera*'s maximum age reaches 600 years, if not 700 years, with future sampling. The only limitation for this species is that it does not live as far north or in the cold environments like *Tsuga canadensis*. Until disease or a pest is found to significantly impact *Liriodendron tulipifera*, this species seems like the best replacement for *Tsuga canadensis*.

Three other species new to dendroclimatic research are recommended as potential replacements for *Tsuga canadensis* or, at the very least, useful for dendrohydroclimatic research: *Betula lenta, Carya glabra* and *Quercus rubra*. Each has good AREV values and can be regularly found more than 200 years in age. It is not too unusual to find *Betula lenta* and *Carya glabra* 250-300+ years old (Pederson et al. 2005, Eastern OLDLIST 2011). Continued exploration of species like *Carya glabra* will likely reveal greater ages as has been found for other less-well studied species like *Betula lenta*. While *Quercus rubra*'s AREV is relatively low, one chronology has a value = 4.00, which is greater than the median AREV of all

chronologies used here (2.59). One limitation is that Quercus rubra rarely reaches more

than 300 years (Orwig et al. 2001, Eastern OLDLIST 2011).

## **Literature Cited**

- Cook, E. R., and P. J. Krusic, 2004: The North American Drought Atlas. *Lamont-Doherty Earth Observatory and the National Science Foundation,.* http://iridl.ldeo.columbia.edu/SOURCES/.LDEO/.TRL/.NADA2004/.pdsi-atlas.html (Accessed November 8, 2011).
- Cook, E. R., and et al., 2008: North American Summer PDSI Reconstructions, Version 2a. *IGBP PAGES/World Data Center for Paleoclimatology Data Contribution Series # 2008-046. NOAA/NGDC Paleoclimatology Program*,. http://www.ncdc.noaa.gov/paleo/pdsi.html (Accessed November 11, 2011).
- Cook, E. R., D. M. Meko, D. W. Stahle, and M. K. Cleaveland, 1999: Drought reconstructions for the continental United States. *Journal of Climate*, **12**, 1145–1162.
- Eastern OLDLIST, Eastern OLDLIST: a database of maximum tree ages for eastern North America. 2011,. http://www.ldeo.columbia.edu/~adk/oldlisteast/ (Accessed December 1, 2011).
- Kalnay, E. and Coauthors, 1996: The NCEP/NCAR 40-year reanalysis project. *Bulletin of the American Meteorological Society*, **77**, 437–471.
- Maxwell, R. S., A. E. Hessl, E. R. Cook, and N. Pederson, 2011: A multispecies tree ring reconstruction of Potomac River streamflow (950–2001). *Water Resources Research*, 47, 1–12, doi:10.1029/2010WR010019.
- Orwig, D. a, C. V. Cogbill, D. R. Foster, and J. F. O'Keefe, 2001: Variations in old-growth structure and definitions: forest dynamics on Wachusett Mountain, Massachusetts. *Ecological Applications*, **11**, 437–452.
- Pederson, N., 2010: External Characteristics of Old Trees in the Eastern Deciduous Forest. *Natural Areas Journal*, **30**, 396–407.
- Pederson, N., A. W. D'Amato, and D. A. Orwig, 2005: Natural History from Dendrochronology: Maximum Ages and Canopy Persistence of Rarely Studied Hardwood Species. *Proceedings of the 15th Central Hardwood Forest Conference*, Eds. D.S. Buckley and W.K. Clatterbuck, Asheville, U.S. Department of Agriculture Forest Service Southern Research Station, 695–701.

Rodionov, S. N., 2004: A sequential algorithm for testing climate regime shifts. *Geophysical Research Letters*, **31**, 2–5.